



**United States Department of State**

*Washington, D.C. 20520*

June 11, 2018

Case No. F-2016-01568

Segments: PA/EX-0003C1, FA/EX-0009C1,  
PA/EX-0010IC1, PA/EX-0011C1,  
PA/EX-0012C1, and PA/EX-0013C1

Arthur Spitzer, Esq.  
American Civil Liberties Union of the Nation's Capital  
4301 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 434  
Washington, DC 20008

Dear Mr. Spitzer:

I refer to our letter dated April 16, 2018, regarding the release of certain Department of State records under the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552.

The review of eight documents responsive to your request has been completed and we have determined that one document may be released in full and seven documents may be released in part. The released material is enclosed.

An enclosure explains the FOIA exemptions and other grounds for withholding material. In some cases, two or more exemptions may apply to the same document. All non-exempt material that is reasonably segregable from exempt material has been released.

This completes our processing of your request. If you have any questions, please contact DOJ Trial Attorney Ryan Parker at 202-514-4336 or [ryan.parker@usdoj.gov](mailto:ryan.parker@usdoj.gov).

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Eric F. Stein" followed by a stylized flourish.

Eric F. Stein, Director  
Office of Information Programs and Services

Enclosures:  
As stated

The Freedom of Information Act (5 USC 552)

FOIA Exemptions

- (b)(1) Information specifically authorized by an executive order to be kept secret in the interest of national defense or foreign policy. Executive Order 13526 includes the following classification categories:
- 1.4(a) military plans, systems, or operations;
  - 1.4(b) foreign government information;
  - 1.4(c) intelligence activities, sources or methods, or cryptology;
  - 1.4(d) foreign relations or foreign activities of the US, including confidential sources;
  - 1.4(e) scientific, technological, or economic matters relating to national security, including defense against transnational terrorism;
  - 1.4(f) U.S. Government programs for safeguarding nuclear materials or facilities;
  - 1.4(g) vulnerabilities or capabilities of systems, installations, infrastructures, projects, plans, or protection services relating to US national security, including defense against transnational terrorism;
  - 1.4(h) weapons of mass destruction;
- (b)(2) Related solely to the internal personnel rules and practices of an agency.
- (b)(3) Specifically exempted from disclosure by statute (other than 5 USC 552), for example:
- ARMEX Arms Export Control Act, 22 USC 2778(e)
  - EXPORT Export Administration Act of 1979, 50 App. USC 2411(c)(1)
  - FSA Foreign Service Act of 1980, 22 USC 4003 & 4004
  - INA Immigration and Nationality Act, 8 USC 1202(f)
  - IRAN Iran Claims Settlement Act, Sec. 505, 50 USC 1701, note
- (b)(4) Trade secrets and confidential commercial or financial information
- (b)(5) Interagency or intra-agency communications forming part of the deliberative process, attorney-client privilege, or attorney work product
- (b)(6) Personal privacy information
- (b)(7) Law enforcement information whose disclosure would:
- (A) interfere with enforcement proceedings
  - (B) deprive a person of a fair trial
  - (C) constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy
  - (D) disclose confidential sources
  - (E) disclose investigation techniques
  - (F) endanger life or physical safety of an individual

Other Grounds for Withholding

NR Material not responsive to a FOIA request excised with the agreement of the requester

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

**From:** Herrmann, Lois M (PACE)  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 06, 2009 1:01 PM  
**To:** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Subject:** RE: Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

RELEASE IN PART B3  
NATSECACT1947,B6

Clear once [redacted] does. And he should use a disclaimer re. State. B3 NATSECACT1947  
Lois Herrmann

**From:** Miller, Lisa M (PACE) **On Behalf Of** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 06, 2009 11:29 AM  
**To:** PA SCP  
**Cc:** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Subject:** FW: Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

SCP, Does PA need to clear? [redacted]

[redacted] Please advise. Thanks.

B3 NATSECACT1947

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 05, 2009 6:03 PM  
**To:** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Cc:** Nelson, Susan H  
**Subject:** FW: Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

B6

I am submitting for clearance a slide presentation (described below) that has been approved by my supervisor, Susan Nelson, Director of INR's Office of Outreach. [redacted]

B3 NATSECACT1947

[redacted] Please call me at 64386 with any questions. Thank you.

[redacted]  
Office of Outreach  
Bureau of Intelligence and Research

B6

**From:** [redacted]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 05, 2009 11:03 AM  
**To:** Nelson, Susan H  
**Subject:** Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

B6

Sue,

Attached please find a slide presentation that I will give at a USG-sponsored roundtable on "Evaluating Strategic Engagement Programs," which will be held in Colorado Springs, 11-12 August. The roundtable, organized by USAF's Institute for National Security Studies (on behalf of DOD's Defense Threat Reduction Agency), will compare experiences of different organizations in engaging international expertise to help understand national and global security challenges. I have attached the invitation letter and preliminary agenda to provide further context.

I have been invited to talk about the experiences of INR's Global Futures Forum (GFF) program, drawing upon my personal knowledge gained from having helped to develop and manage this initiative from its inception in 2005 to the



present. In addition to discussing lessons learned from workshops and online interaction, I will also provide a brief history and description of GFF so that the roundtable participants can have a better basis for evaluating these lessons.

B6

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

**From:** Miller, Lisa M (PACE) on behalf of PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 19, 2009 11:41 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** PA Clearances Mailbox; Nelson, Susan H  
**Subject:** FW: Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

RELEASE IN PART B3  
NATSECACT1947,B6

B6

PA/SCP Lois Herrmann clears for PA as long as [REDACTED] does and B3 NATSECACT1947 disclaimer attached below is included. Thanks.

"The views expressed in this article are those of the author, and do not necessarily reflect those of the U.S. Department of State or the U.S. Government."

*Lisa M. Miller* for "PA Clearances Mailbox"  
Bureau of Public Affairs, HST, Room 6800  
Staff Assistant  
U.S. Department of State  
Tel: 202-647-6197  
[MillerLM@state.gov](mailto:MillerLM@state.gov)

Unless otherwise noted - this message is UNCLASSIFIED based on definitions provided in E.O. 12958.

The Bureau of Public Affairs (PA) has examined this document and has found that it does not violate the PA-specific guidelines for employees stated in 3 FAM 4170 -- related to review of materials of official concern prepared in an employee's private capacity --

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 05, 2009 6:03 PM  
**To:** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Cc:** Nelson, Susan H  
**Subject:** FW: Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

B6

I am submitting for clearance a slide presentation (described below) that has been approved by my supervisor, Susan Nelson, Director of INR's Office of Outreach. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] Please call me at 64386 with any questions. Thank you.

B3 NATSECACT1947

[REDACTED]  
Office of Outreach  
Bureau of Intelligence and Research

B6

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 05, 2009 11:03 AM  
**To:** Nelson, Susan H  
**Subject:** Presentation at USAF Institute for National Security Studies Roundtable, 12 August

B6

Sue,

Attached please find a slide presentation that I will give at a USG-sponsored roundtable or "Evaluating Strategic Engagement Programs," which will be held in Colorado Springs, 11-12 August. The roundtable, organized by USAF's Institute for National Security Studies (on behalf of DOD's Defense Threat Reduction Agency), will compare experiences of different organizations in engaging international expertise to help understand national and global security challenges. I have attached the invitation letter and preliminary agenda to provide further context.

I have been invited to talk about the experiences of INR's Global Futures Forum (GFF) program, drawing upon my personal knowledge gained from having helped to develop and manage this initiative from its inception in 2005 to the present. In addition to discussing lessons learned from workshops and online interaction, I will also provide a brief history and description of GFF so that the roundtable participants can have a better basis for evaluating these lessons.

B6

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

---

**From:** Rosen, Rebecca T <RosenRT2@state.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 10, 2015 1:20 PM  
**To:** 'Morse, Cameron R CIV WHS ESD (US)'; 'Chykirda, Daniel J CIV WHS ESD (US)'  
**Cc:** 'Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US)'; 'Walker, Darrell W CIV WHS ESD (US)'; Godani, Behar; Fahy, Alden; PA Reviews Mailbox; Gill, Ruchi Gugliani  
**Subject:** RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State  
**Attachments:** Publication Review - Enhanced Interrogation, the Report on Rendition, Detention, and Interrogation, and the Return of Kriegsraison; Alden - DOD Publication Review: Identifying the Start of Conflict and the 9-11 Attacks

**Importance:** High

**Follow Up Flag:** Follow up

**Flag Status:** Flagged

**RELEASE IN FULL**

Good morning Mr. Morse and Mr. Chykirda,

I hope you're both doing well. The author, Mr. Farley, reached out to us today to inform us that if he does not hear an update on these articles from DOD, he will plan to publish by the end of the week. In his conversations with PA, he mentioned his First Amendment rights and this holding up his process.

While we greatly appreciate the two of you being very responsive since we have been in touch in late July, DOD has had these articles for 6 months and over a year respectively. Is there any update we could provide the author with today on this matter? I'll be speaking with him this afternoon, so would appreciate any update you could provide.

- Identifying the Start of Conflict and the 9-11 Attacks has been with DOD since October 2014
- Enhanced Interrogation, the Report on Rendition, Detention, and Interrogation, and the Return of Kriegsraison with DOD since May 16, 2015

Thank you very kindly and happy to discuss further if you would like.

Best,

Becca

Rebecca Rosen  
Advisor, Public Affairs  
U.S. Department of State  
D: 202-647-6249 | M: 202-793-0676  
rosenrt2@state.gov

-----Original Message-----

**From:** PA Reviews Mailbox [mailto:pareviews@state.gov]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 09, 2015 9:52 AM  
**To:** 'Morse, Cameron R CIV WHS ESD (US)'; PA Reviews Mailbox



Cc: 'Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US)'; 'Chykirda, Daniel J CIV WHS ESD (US)'; 'Walker, Darrell W CIV WHS ESD (US)';  
Godani, Behar; Fahy, Alden; Rosen, Rebecca T  
Subject: RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State  
Importance: High

Dear Cameron and Daniel:

We are writing to request a status update on the two articles for Mr. Ben Farley:

Case 15-FR-0020, "Enhanced Interrogation"  
Case 15-S-1964, "Identifying the Start of Conflict"

Mr. Farley has contacted our Front Office about these articles and we would like to provide an update and an estimated date for completion.

Thank you for your assistance.

PA Reviews

-----Original Message-----

From: Morse, Cameron R CIV WHS ESD (US) [mailto:cameron.r.morse.civ@mail.mil]  
Sent: Wednesday, August 12, 2015 11:44 AM  
To: PA Reviews Mailbox  
Cc: Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US); Chykirda, Daniel J CIV WHS ESD (US); Walker, Darrell W CIV WHS ESD (US);  
Godani, Behar; Fahy, Alden  
Subject: RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Dear PA Colleagues,

I apologize for not replying yesterday, while we in DoD are not under the microscope like State is at the moment, we do have a lot going on.

Case 15-FR-0020, "Enhanced Interrogation," is still under review by the DoD Office of General Counsel (OGC) and the Office of the Under Secretary for Policy (OUSD/P). Given the subject matter, both a legal and policy chop are necessary. Both offices are aware of the time constraints, but I do not have an ETA at the moment.

Case 15-S-1964, "Identifying the Start of Conflict," is also under review by OGC and OUSD/P, as well as the Joint Staff, for the reasons described above. Daniel Chykirda is the action officer handling this case and he can provide more information.

If we can be of further assistance please feel free to contact us. Thank you.

v/r,

Cameron R. G. Morse  
Chief, Policy Branch  
Defense Office of Prepublication  
and Security Review  
1155 Defense Pentagon  
Washington, DC 20301-1155  
703-614-4928



-----Original Message-----

From: PA Reviews Mailbox [<http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=mailto:pareviews@state.gov>]  
Sent: Wednesday, August 12, 2015 9:58 AM  
To: Morse, Cameron R CIV WHS ESD (US)  
Cc: Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US); PA Reviews Mailbox  
Subject: RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Good Morning Mr. Morse:

We are following up on our e-mail from yesterday on the status of the DOD reviews of Mr. Farley's articles.

Please provide a status update as soon as possible.

Thank you.

-----Original Message-----

From: PA Reviews Mailbox  
Sent: Tuesday, August 11, 2015 10:26 AM  
To: 'Cameron.r.morse.civ@mail.mil'  
Cc: PA Reviews Mailbox  
Subject: FW: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Good Morning Mr. Morse:

We are following up on the status of the review requests for Mr. Benjamin Farley (noted below).

Thank you for your assistance.

PA Reviews

-----Original Message-----

From: Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US) [<http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=mailto:rotonya.m.kemp.civ@mail.mil>]  
Sent: Tuesday, August 11, 2015 9:55 AM  
To: PA Clearances Mailbox; Chykirda, Daniel J CIV WHS ESD (US)  
Cc: Rosen, Rebecca T; PA Reviews Mailbox; Morse, Cameron R CIV WHS ESD (US)  
Subject: RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Good morning,

Thank you for your inquiry.

Our FRUS/Policy team is currently working the two articles by Mr. Farley. Mr. Cameron Morse/Policy Branch Chief, cc:dd, can further assist you with this matter. His email address is [Cameron.r.morse.civ@mail.mil](mailto:Cameron.r.morse.civ@mail.mil).

Sincerely,  
Rotonya Kemp

-----Original Message-----

From: PA Clearances Mailbox

[<http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=http://redirect.state.sbu/?url=mailto:paclearances@state.gov>]

Sent: Tuesday, August 11, 2015 9:38 AM

To: Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US); Chykirda, Daniel J CIV WHS ESD (US)

Cc: Rosen, Rebecca T; PA Reviews Mailbox

Subject: RE: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Good Morning:

We are following up on the status of the two articles by Mr. Farley:

1. Enhanced Interrogation, the Report on Rendition, Detention, and Interrogation, and the Return of Kriegsraison; Our case number is DOPSR #15-FR-0020, Action Officer: Cameron Morse, the case is currently assigned to OGC and OUSD(Policy) with a suspense date of 31 July.
2. Identifying the State of Conflict and the 9-11 Attacks.

Thank you for your assistance.

PA Clearances

-----Original Message-----

From: PA Clearances Mailbox

Sent: Thursday, August 06, 2015 3:18 PM

To: 'Kemp, Rotonya M CIV WHS ESD (US)'; 'daniel.j.chykirda.civ@mail.mil'

Cc: Rosen, Rebecca T; PA Clearances Mailbox

Subject: Following up: Pre-Publication Reviews, Mr. Farley - DOD/State

Importance: High

Good afternoon Rotonya and Daniel,

We wanted to touch base on the review status for these pieces as Ms. Rosen is currently on travel and has limited access to blackberry. We were looking forward to receiving an e-mail from your office regarding article 1. earlier this week. Please let us know.

Thank you,

PA Clearances

1. Enhanced Interrogation, the Report on Rendition, Detention, and Interrogation, and the Return of Kriegsraison; Our case number is DOPSR #15-FR-0020, Action Officer: Cameron Morse, the case is currently assigned to OGC and OUSD(Policy) with a suspense date of 31 July.

2. Identifying the State of Conflict and the 9-11 Attacks (sheared September 2014). This case is not listed in our SRTA database. Please resend the action again and we will assign it accordingly.

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

---

**From:** Cox, Edward J <CoxEJ1@state.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, October 09, 2015 8:55 AM  
**To:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Cc:** AF-Press  
**Subject:** RE: AF Review - Quotes for Article on 1994 Rwandan Genocide

RELEASE IN PART  
B5

PA Colleagues,

Thanks for your patience on this. As below, we'll request that Levinger return to the original 2007 ground rules and refer to Ehrenreich as an unnamed "State Department analyst."

Quotes are fine with one caveat.

B5

Hope this helps, and sorry again for the wait.

Best,  
Ed

SBU  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Cox, Edward J  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 08, 2015 1:16 PM  
**To:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Cc:** Loree, Jeffrey M  
**Subject:** RE: AF Review - Quotes for Article on 1994 Rwandan Genocide

Please forgive the delay in closing this loop. I'm waiting for a final clarification from Rick (Ehrenreich) himself on one of the quotes.

I can tell you now that since he is still an active USG employee we and the Desk both think it best to return to the ground rules of the 2007 interview, which were to quote him as an unnamed State Department analyst. Author could describe him as "experienced" or similar as appropriate.

Quotes themselves look good pending the one clarification. Will get back to you as soon as I have it.

Thanks,  
Ed

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.



---

**From:** Cox, Edward J  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 07, 2015 9:03 AM  
**To:** PA Reviews Mailbox; AF-Press  
**Cc:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Subject:** RE: AF Review - Quotes for Article on 1994 Rwandan Genocide

Colleagues – I do apologize; I somehow missed this in the early morning shuffle on Friday. I have reached out to the Desk for their input and will get back to you today. Thanks, Ed

Ed Cox  
Press Officer  
AF/PDPA

This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** PA Reviews Mailbox [<mailto:pareviews@state.gov>]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, October 07, 2015 6:59 AM  
**To:** AF-Press  
**Cc:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Subject:** FW: AF Review - Quotes for Article on 1994 Rwandan Genocide

AF Colleagues:

Please advise on the status of your review of these quotes.

Thank you.

---

**From:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Sent:** Friday, October 02, 2015 7:35 AM  
**To:** AF-Press  
**Cc:** PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Subject:** AF Review - Quotes for Article on 1994 Rwandan Genocide

AF Colleagues:

In March 2007, INR/AF Analyst Frederick Ehrenreich conducted an interview on the 1994 Rwandan Genocide with Matthew Levinger of the Elliott School of International Affairs at GWU. At the time, Mr. Ehrenreich was seconded to be the Deputy National Intelligence Officer for Africa and had been granted clearance to speak to Mr. Levinger from his boss, National Intelligence Officer for Africa Johnnie Carson.

Levinger recently contacted Mr. Ehrenreich for permission to use various quotes for his article entitled "Why the U.S. Government Failed to Anticipate the Rwandan Genocide of 1994: Lessons for Early Warning Prevention", which is scheduled to run in Genocide Studies and Prevention.

Attached is Mr. Levinger's article, and we are asking you to review Mr. Ehrenreich's quotes, which are located on pages 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, and 15 and are highlighted.

We request your response by **COB Monday, October 5.**

Please let us know if you have any questions.

Thank you

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 11, 2016 9:55 AM  
**To:** PA Clearances Mailbox  
**Subject:** Question about publication

B6

RELEASE IN PART B6

Hi,

I'm trying to figure out if a paper I wrote and which has been accepted for publication needs to be cleared by PA. I work in the Global Criminal Justice office, but I submitted my paper before I started working here. Before GCJ I was a contractor in DRL/IRF, and two years ago I was an intern in GCJ, but the paper does not draw on any of the work I did at these positions. I was not employed in either position when I submitted the paper.

The paper is attached – it focuses on the Senate's report on the CIA's post-9/11 interrogation program as a form of transitional justice and truth-telling. It contains a disclaimer stating the following: "All opinions and analysis in this paper are my own and do not reflect the views of any other individual or organization. All errors are mine." It does not contain my job title or any reference to my employment with the Department of State.

Could you tell me if I need to clear this and if so, with what offices?

Thank you!

B6

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
Foreign Affairs Officer  
Office of Global Criminal Justice  
U.S. Department of State  
(202) 647-5093  
<http://www.state.gov/j/gcj/>

B6

RELEASE IN PART B3  
NATSECACT1947,B6

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

**From:** Posey, Tameka S <PoseyTS@state.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 04, 2016 10:12 AM  
**To:** Laine, Andrew J; PA Reviews Mailbox  
**Subject:** [REDACTED] Review

RELEASE IN PART B1,B3  
NATSECACT1947,B6

B6

PA received PRB's responses to the revision of Facing an Ugly Truth on Wednesday, July 27, 2016. PRB still required [REDACTED]  
[REDACTED] to delete one phrase [REDACTED]

B6

[REDACTED] Susan met with Katie Hallock on  
Wednesday and agreed with PRB's decision to have the phrase removed. [REDACTED] was notified of the PRB's decision  
on Thursday, July 28. [REDACTED] agreed to remove the phrase and is moving forward with the publication.

B6

This case was closed on July 28, 2016, with a 32 day time-lapse.

B1  
B3 NATSECACT1947  
B6

Classified derivative CIA letter dated 10-13-2017, ref F-2017-01990 ~ Class: Confidential ~  
Reason: 1.4(C) ~ Declassify on: October 13, 2027

**CONFIDENTIAL**



**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

---

**From:** Stevenson, Susan N  
**Sent:** Friday, July 29, 2016 7:51 AM  
**To:** Hallock, Catherine A  
**Cc:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED] B6

That's great to hear. Thanks.

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive  
**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL//NOFORN~~  
**Classified By:** Alden Fahy, Program Analyst  
**Derived From:** Derived from previous message in thread.  
**Declassify On:** 20410708

RELEASE IN PART B1,B3 NATSECACT1947,B3  
CIA PERS/ORG,B6

---

**From:** Hallock, Catherine A  
**Sent:** Friday, July 29, 2016 7:48 AM  
**To:** Stevenson, Susan N  
**Cc:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED] B6

Susan,

Based on our conversation on Wednesday, I did relay the information to [REDACTED] She accepts the decision and will delete the phrase in question. B6

Katie

Catherine A. Hallock  
Special Assistant  
Bureau of Public Affairs  
[HallockCA@state.sgov](mailto:HallockCA@state.sgov) | 202-736-4895

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive  
**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL//NOFORN~~  
**Classified By:** Alden Fahy, Program Analyst  
**Derived From:** Derived from previous message in thread.  
**Declassify On:** 20410708

---

**From:** Stevenson, Susan N  
**Sent:** Friday, July 29, 2016 7:36 AM  
**To:** Hallock, Catherine A  
**Cc:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED] B6

Katie,

To close the loop, yes as discussed, please relay this info to [REDACTED]

B6

Susan

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive  
**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL//NOFORN~~  
**Classified By:** Alden Fahy, Program Analyst  
**Derived From:** Derived from previous message in thread.  
**Declassify On:** 20410708

---

**From:** Hallock, Catherine A  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 27, 2016 11:18 AM  
**To:** Stevenson, Susan N  
**Cc:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Subject:** FW: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED]

B6

Susan,

We have an answer on the pre-publication review of [REDACTED] piece. The PRB is still requiring her to delete one phrase.

B6

If you don't have any objection, I will pass on this information to [REDACTED] I'd like to touch base with you about this before I write to her, though.

B6

Katie

Catherine A. Hallock  
Special Assistant  
Bureau of Public Affairs  
[HallockCA@state.sgov](mailto:HallockCA@state.sgov) | 202-736-4895

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive  
**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL//NOFORN~~  
**Classified By:** Alden Fahy, Program Analyst  
**Derived From:** Derived from previous message in thread.  
**Declassify On:** 20410708

---

**From:** Fahy, Alden F  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 27, 2016 9:28 AM  
**To:** Posey, Tameka S; Hallock, Catherine A; Godani, Behar  
**Cc:** PA\_Clearances  
**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED]

B6

(U) Tameka,

(U) Apologies for the delay. We do have a response from the PRB, which I have pasted below.

B1  
B3 NATSECACT1947  
B6

(U) Since the Board is upholding its original opinion, the Department of State, on behalf of the author, may formally appeal the Board's reconsideration decision. If State wishes to appeal, please do so within 30 days of the Board's reconsideration decision. The appeal must be in writing and must be sent to the Board's Chair. Appeal documentation must include the material intended for publication and any supporting material the Executive Director should consider. Please note that in all cases, the decision of the ExDir/CIA is final. If an appeal is NOT brought to the attention of ExDir/CIA within applicable time limits, the original decision of the PRB will be adopted.

(U) Please let me know if you have any questions.

(U) Thanks!

(U) Alden

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive

**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL//NOFORN~~

**Classified By:** Alden Fahy, Program Analyst

**Derived From:** [redacted] to Fahy email 07/08/2016

**Declassify On:** 20410708

B3 NATSECACT1947  
B3 CIA PERS/ORG

---

**From:** Posey, Tameka S

**Sent:** Monday, July 25, 2016 11:34 AM

**To:** Hallock, Catherine A; Fahy, Alden F; Godani, Behar



**Cc:** PA\_Clearances

**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by

B6

Good morning Alden and Behar,

Have you received any updates from the PRB since last week?

Thank you,  
Tameka

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Hallock, Catherine A

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 20, 2016 11:48 AM

**To:** Fahy, Alden F; Posey, Tameka S; Godani, Behar

**Cc:** PA\_Clearances

**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by

B6

Thanks!

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Fahy, Alden F

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 20, 2016 11:31 AM

**To:** Hallock, Catherine A; Posey, Tameka S; Godani, Behar

**Cc:** PA\_Clearances

**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by

Hi Katie,

We are still waiting to hear from the PRB. I just sent them a note asking about the status.

Thanks!

Alden

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Hallock, Catherine A

**Sent:** Tuesday, July 19, 2016 5:44 PM

**To:** Posey, Tameka S; Fahy, Alden F; Godani, Behar

**Cc:** PA\_Clearances

**Subject:** RE: Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by

B6

Dear Alden and Behar,



Tameka is teleworking this week, so in case you had just replied to her, I wanted to follow up to see if there has been any response from the PRB. The employee is being pushed by the journal where she is planning to publish to submit a final version and requests an expedited review.

Thanks for any update you can provide!

Best,  
Katie

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Sent:** Wednesday, July 13, 2016 9:54 AM  
**To:** Fahy, Alden F; Godani, Behar  
**Cc:** PA\_Clearances  
**Subject:** Following up Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED]

B6

Good morning Alden and Behar,

Checking in – have you received any updates from the PRB? This is actually my first case where an employee did not remove what was requested of them. Its interesting to see what the PRB's response will be.

Thank you,  
Tameka

PA Reviews

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 05, 2016 4:43 PM  
**To:** Fahy, Alden F; Godani, Behar  
**Cc:** PA\_Clearances  
**Subject:** Alden/Behar: Pre-publication Review for Manuscript by [REDACTED]

B6

Hi Alden and Behar,

We request an expedited review with the CIA's PRB for [REDACTED] revision (pg. 32) to Facing an Ugly Truth: The Senate's Report on CIA Torture as Truth-Telling. The author notes that the information was pulled from media reports and with her attributing the information to the media and providing appropriate footnotes, she hopes that the PRB will agree to approve the revision for publication.

B6

Additional details are noted in her email below. Please let us know if it would be possible for  to speak with B6 the PRB reviewer.

Thank you.

Tameka

PA Reviews

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

**Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)**

---

**From:** Bedi, Kristin T  
**Sent:** Friday, October 21, 2016 2:44 PM  
**To:** Hartmann, Lorraine (Lori)  
**Subject:** F-2016-01568

RELEASE IN PART  
B6

These are from Susan Stevenson for the FOIA-2016-01568. I'll be forwarding more. Thanks Kristin

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** Hallock, Catherine A  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 18, 2016 4:28 PM  
**To:** Bedi, Kristin T  
**Subject:** FW: Pre-publication Review Status: Enemy of the Good

First of many responsive to the FOIA request on pre-publication review.

Catherine A. Hallock  
Special Assistant  
Bureau of Public Affairs  
[HallockCA@state.sgov](mailto:HallockCA@state.sgov) | 202-736-4895

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Monday, September 12, 2016 4:35 PM  
**To:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Cc:** PA\_Clearances; Stevenson, Susan N  
**Subject:** RE: Pre-publication Review Status: Enemy of the Good

B6

Thank you, Tameka. This is fabulous news! I can certainly work with this.

Grateful for your assistance throughout this....and look forward to delivering you a signed copy. ☺

Best regards,

[REDACTED]

B6

Sensitive  
This email is UNCLASSIFIED.



**From:** Posey, Tameka S  
**Sent:** Monday, September 12, 2016 4:04 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** PA Clearances; Stevenson, Susan N  
**Subject:** Pre-publication Review Status: Enemy of the Good

B6

[REDACTED]

B6

The Department and CIA have completed the review of your novel, Enemy of the Good, pursuant to 3 FAM 4170 and determined that you may proceed, provided that you remove the material found in the attached and include the disclaimer required for personal capacity communications (see 3 FAM 4176.1), that the views expressed are your own and not necessarily those of the U.S. Government.

Thank you..

Tameka

On behalf of PA Reviews Team

This document is UNCLASSIFIED when separated from ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~ attachment(s).

**Sensitivity:** Sensitive  
**Classification:** ~~CONFIDENTIAL~~  
**Classified By:** Michael Caramelo, Chief, DS/MGT/FOIA-PA, DOS  
**Derived From:** Derived from previous message in thread.  
**Declassify On:** 2026/09/12